



TRANSLANGUAGING BILINGUAL STRATEGIES IN EDUCATIONAL INSTITUTIONS: YOUNG LEARNERS VS ADULT LEARNERS IN ENGLISH LANGUAGE TEACHING (ELT)

¹**Yaghsha Sahar**

Lecturer, Grand Asian University, Sialkot, Punjab, Pakistan

E-mail: yaghshasahar2@gmail.com

ORCID : <https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7814-9006>

²**Ailya Zainab**

Mphil Scholar, University of Sargodha, Punjab, Pakistan

Email: ailyabaloch50@gmail.com

³**Dr. Muhammad Sabboor Hussain**

Professor (English),

University of Sialkot, Punjab, Pakistan

Tel: 0092333-5199440

E-mail: dr.muhammadsabboorhussain@uskt.edu.pk

⁴**Ayesha Rasheed**

Visiting Lecturer, Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan

Email: ayshrasheed759@gmail.com

⁵**Mubeen Ali**

Mphil Scholar, GC Women University Sialkot, Punjab, Pakistan

Email: abcqalbi@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Pakistan is a multi-ethnic country where translanguaging strategies are often practised discretely to support English language teaching. The study explores the translanguaging bilingual strategies used by the teachers in Pakistani educational institutions for young versus adult learners. The sample for this qualitative research was selected through the purposive sampling technique. English language teachers were interviewed until a saturation point was achieved. The study has focused on the teachers' responses and observations of their classes that when and how teachers apply several translanguaging strategies for their young and adult learners of the English language. Their responses were analyzed and compared through Jim Cummins' CALP and BICS model exploring the relevant strategies for young and adult learners of Pakistan. The research would benefit researchers and educational legislators to promote standardized translanguaging strategies designed for young and adult learners to improve their English language communicative and cognitive abilities within the Pakistani educational setting.

Keywords: *Translanguaging, Bilingual Strategies, Young Learners, Adult Learners, English Language.*

INTRODUCTION

Distinct bilingual strategies through translanguaging pedagogical tactics are pervasively applied in the ESL classrooms catering the needs and challenges of both young and adult learners. Since the emergence of English as the global language of the world, has urged the non-native countries to develop expertise in the English language (Rose, McKinley and Galloway, 2021). The engrossing demand for the English language made English Language teaching (ELT) the only significant source for mastering English language skills. So, developing countries, especially Pakistani Educational Institutions, have come up with English teaching and learning. The 'English-only' policy has been incorporated in Pakistani



schools and educational institutions. Therefore, teachers and learners are restricted to using L2 for English language learning and teaching. This restriction imposed by the monolingual language acquisition systems becomes troublesome when acquiring English in ESL or EFL contexts. Even if some students become proficient in L2, several others are often left behind.

Translanguaging bilingual strategies are frequently coming into the practice to help ESL learners and teach English at alleducationalinstitutions inPakistan. The researchershave introduced different sets of translanguaging strategies to foster L2 andbilingual literacy among learners.

Statement of Research Problem

Even after recognizing translanguaging strategies in Pakistan, the area requires further exploration. The educational institutions of Pakistan includeyoung (novice learners) and adults (advancedlearners) that need aseparate yet different set of Translanguaging pedagogy that would dwell on their underlying proficiency in the language.

Scope and Significance

The current study proved significant for the budding researchers and the people associated with pedagogy. It let them explore the Translanguaging pedagogy to a greater extent in Pakistani institutions. The stakeholders and teaching authorities can now clearly understand what and with whom translanguaging bilingual strategies can be used in Pakistan.The present study may also help the researchers explore the areas of research and academic writing that can be traversedthroughTranslanguaging. Similarly, the research may diversify the bilingual teaching policy for adult and young English learners.

Aim and Objectives

The study aims to reconsider the appropriate translanguaging bilingual strategiesfor young and adult learners in ELT classrooms. This research aimed to highlight the effectiveness of translanguaging bilingual strategies for teaching the Englishlanguage as FL (foreign language) in an ELT classroom in the Pakistani context.Thus, the objectives of the study were as follows:-

- To look for the appropriate translanguaging strategies for young and adult learners
- Todiscuss certain TranslanguagingBilingual Strategies for ELT in Pakistani Institutions
- To compare and contrast Translanguaging strategies for young versus adult learners

REVIEW OF THE PREVIOUS STUDIES

Historical Grounds of Pedagogical Bilingual Strategies

The idea of implying a strategy of using the transfer of language/linguistic knowledge to learn another language remains in discussion for decades. Elashhab (2020) as mentioned Almayez(2022) marks code-switching as the foundation for translanguaging. The past few decades have witnessed the value of code-switching in English language pedagogical practices. Goodman and Tastanbek (2021) view this methodology as a social practice that uses language in social settings where multilingualism and bilingualism are learnt in separation.

However,Creese and Blackledge (2010) have determined the inadequacy of incorporating code-switching tactics for pedagogical purposes for ELT.It is thus the least effective representation of another languageto bilingual learners.Gardner-Chloros (2009) explores code-switching as a monoglossic phenomenon that does not set the ground for learning a language. However, Canagarajah (2012) argues that even monoglossic pedagogies



and phenomena provide some stances where the target language (TL) is achieved by the intervention of a Foreign Language (FL) or Native Language (NL), depending on the context.

Translanguaging and its Early Development

There are two forms of translanguaging; a weak form given by Cen Williams' definition and a strong form identified by Garcia (Turnbull, 2019). Garcia (2011) as mentioned in Zabrodskaja (2013) identifies Translanguaging as the repertoire of a variety of strategies and practices comprising a set of strategies that support the bilinguals to set the stage for learning a new language and improve their bi-literacy of the bilingual world around them. Translanguaging also channelizes the development of common underlying proficiency among learners. Martin-Beltrán (2014) ; Treffers-Daller, (2025) define translanguaging as a practice, evolving cognition with socio-cultural context, encapsulated in every field of life and learning. Meanwhile, Mazak (2016) considers translanguaging the ideology that advocates bilingualism globally; the theoretical approval toward bilinguals points towards the single bilingual inventory rather than discrete systems of bilingual linguistic knowledge. Translanguaging continues to make the acquisition of the second language much easier and more effective by relying upon the shared knowledge system of learners.

The surge in the suitability of translanguaging for learning leads toward pedagogical environments. Translanguaging was Cen Williams introduced in the 1990s, was initially incorporated into the Welsh education system. The shift was turned towards the students' and teachers' attitudes and perceptions towards translanguaging. Garcia & Wei (2014) draw the connections of Translanguaging to the mainstream education system. Especially when the term is not directed toward the educationists, the aptitude for using two languages for teaching purposes has been studied to its full extent. Mazak (2016) provides five aspects of translanguaging, out of which three inter-relate translanguaging as: A string of pedagogic practices, not a single refined methodology, secondly, a pedagogical activity that lets an instructor teach a foreign language (FL) through linguistic and semiotic knowledge of the previously learnt languages. Likewise, the 'group of interconnected strategies that supports practices of translation and code-switching to transform the world; reinventing the bilingual environment within classrooms. Almayez (2022) claim that the increased multicultural classrooms have given a chance to emerge translanguaging as profound practice for teaching a foreign language FL (preferably English).

The situation of translanguaging bilingual strategies in developing multi-ethnic countries is demeaning. The hegemony of the English language in such lands has imbibed the 'English only' policy in the education system. Clyne (2008) considers that such a "one-language-only" policy has triggered the 'Monolingual pedagogy attitude' toward foreign language learning. Hence in south Asian and colonized countries like Pakistan, the standardization of a monolingual mindset for teaching a target language, especially English is visible (Makalela, 2015; Wright, 2023). The pedagogical policies and teaching strategies equally supplement this situation (Igboanusi, 2014). However, Wang (2019) argues against the single language policy as the only genre of teaching strategies to teach a new language to non-native/ ESL learners. Translanguaging bilingual strategies brighten the chance of learning a foreign language (FL) / target language (TL) in educational contexts.

Translanguaging Bilingual Strategies in South Asia

The educational institutions of the Asian continent where English is learnt and taught as a second language appear to use certain bilingual strategies. Ooi and Abdul Aziz (2021) review and analyze the gradual progress of translanguaging throughout the South Asian



continent. Pedagogical practices have been moderated to utilize Translanguaging for enhancing the four skills, especially the writing skills at the undergraduate level. Ali (2021) evaluates his class to estimate the improvement of students through translanguaging bilingual strategies. Translanguaging practices not only intensify the linguistic paradigm of the language but incorporate certain cultural notions during the learning process. Saleh and Morgan (2022) correlate translanguaging strategies as a binder of power relations in the written academic discourse. The hegemony represented through writing becomes evident and understandable by applying translanguaging tactics in a classroom with bilingual participants. Rafi and Fox (2020) evaluate the writing practices of multilingual Pakistani learners through translanguaging ELT practices.

For impact full ELT practices, Wang (2019) improvises translanguaging bilingual strategies dealing with explanation, management, and interpersonal communication of the language. Bilingual strategies facilitate learners' language acquisition process in a classroom. Pentimonti et al. (2017) describe the low and high scaffolding techniques that may occur more frequently in a pedagogical environment than other techniques. Translanguaging strategies benefit bilingual students and let them use FL in an extended environment with better liberty (McClain et al., 2021; Harvey and Wong, 2024). Certain translanguaging practices have emerged in a particular context, such as Translanguaging through Translation, Discussion, Use of Multi-media and Visuals, Conversation and Dictionaries, etc (Saleh, 2020); Sah and Kubota, 2022). Instructors and pupils in developing countries, especially Pakistan and neighbouring countries, are prominently using L1 in their educational Institutions. Storch and Aldosari (2010) confirm that for both teachers and students, using L1 can improve the comfort level and breach the gap between the FL and learners. However, the irrational use of bilingual strategies may have crucial effects on learners and teachers. Saleh (2020) discusses the use of "Natural" translanguaging practices rather than "official" strategies that generate inconsistent performance rates among bilingual students. For consistently positive results, translanguaging strategies must be teamed up with background knowledge and requirements of the learners.

Research Gap

The previous studies illustrate a glaring research gap. The previous researchers did not evaluate the several techniques of Translanguaging appropriate in Pakistani educational institutions. The researchers used an observation-based research tool that may only provide instantaneous results, accompanied by several constraints. So the area of specificity in Translanguaging practices according to the adult and young learners is still unexplored.

Research Questions

Thus, the present study tends to fill the voids of the literature through the following research questions.

Primary Research Question

What are the suitable translanguaging bilingual strategies for young and adult learners?

Secondary Research Questions

1. What are the effective translanguaging strategies in Pakistani Educational Institutions?
2. What are the distinct features of translanguaging strategies for young vs adult learners?

Theoretical Framework

The theoretical framework for the particular study is Jim Cummins's one balloon theory, widely known as the common underlying proficiency (CUP) model, configured in



1991. The model stresses the transfer of First language knowledge while acquiring the second language. Cummins (1998) explains that the meta-linguistic knowledge of the first language is utilized for acquiring the second language. Ali (2021) discusses that bilingual learners make use of transferring their L1's linguistic knowledge and implications to attain the knowledge of another language. The particular theory was again modified with the inclusion of elaborative concepts of BICS and CALP.

Conceptual Framework

The data is collected and analyzed with the lens of CALP and BICS elements of Cummins' CUP theory. BICS refer to the basic interpersonal communicative skills required and induced to carry out interpersonal functions of day-to-day life. These skills also support accurately expressing feelings, emotions, instructions and opinions. A learner with BICS can transfer interlinguistic knowledge aptly. CALP (cognitive academic language proficiency) signify the linguistic knowledge of education registers and academic lexicon. An individual with CALP can understand, evaluate and perform well in an academic setting. The terms were explained with relevance to foreign language learners (Prokopchuk, 2022). The linguistic knowledge of the first knowledge flourishes the communicative skills and academic knowledge that help a learner to express, instruct and address his thoughts with others.

MATERIAL AND METHODOLOGY

Research Design

This particular research is qualitative was qualitative in nature. For this specific study, the researcher has chosen the qualitative research design including both interviews and observations. Such research tools deeply interpret and evaluate the perceptions and practices of the English language teachers in the Pakistani context (Kostere & Kostere, 2021). The objectives were not be able to meet with a sole quantitative study or a mixed method approach with in the limited time frame and course constraints.

Research Tool

The tools for this study include semi-structured interviews and class observations. These interviews consisted of 15 questions about the strategies mentioned in Madkur (2022) and Wang (2019). Every participant was interviewed for 25 minutes on average. Probing questions were asked to explore the participant's perceptions regarding the appropriateness of the translanguaging bilingual strategies. Prior to the interviews, interview protocol was followed. The observation sheet was adapted by Romanowski(2019) and Saleh & Morgan (2022). The teaching sessions of the interviewees were observed, and data was collected through manual field notes.

Population and Sampling

The population opted for this particular research is the teachers of the English language teaching of well-known Pakistani educational Institutions to infer the application of the Translanguaging bilingual strategies. The teachers were selected through the purposive sampling criterion.

1. Teaching experience of a minimum of one year in the bilingual context
2. Bilingual teacher with a degree in the English language

The sampling size is divided into two sets of participants. Teachers for Young Learners (TYL) include primary and elementary English teachers. Teachers for Adult learners (TAL) include intermediate and undergraduate level teachers. The education system of Pakistan consists of both private and public sectors of education. So participants from both sectors have been included. Both male and female participants were opted for to maintain clarity of



results. The selection of participants in the study was dependent upon the saturation point achieved in the interviews. The teachers have been denoted as T1 to T6 to maintain confidentiality. The sampling size for observations was the standard Pakistani classroom size.

Data Collection and Synthesis

The interview data were collected before the month of ramazan. Firstly, the interviews were conducted to get the general idea of the instructors' practices and then the observations were held after the month of ramazan. The observed data were tokenized following the BICS model; meanwhile the interviewed data were initially transcribed and then codified for analysis through Nvivo software.



Table. 1
Teachers' credentials

Sr	Name	Qualification	Level of student	Age	Area of Teaching (Region)	of Sector	Experien ce (years)	Gender
1	T1	Bilingual English teacher with a degree in MS	Adult Learner s	25	Rural	Government	3 years	Female
2	T2	Bilingual English teacher with an MS degree	Adult Learner s	27	Urban	Private	6 years	Male
3	T3	Bilingual English teacher with an MS degree	Adult Learner s	24	Urban	Private	2 years	Male
4	T4	Bilingual English teacher with a BS English degree	Young Learner s	25	Rural	Private	5 years	Female
5	T5	Bilingual English teacher with a BS English degree	Young Learner s	23	Urban	Private	6 years	Female
6	T6	Bilingual English teacher with a BS English degree	Young Learner s	26	Urban	Government	4 years	Female

*Only those teachers were mentioned whose responses are utilized in this study.



Analytical Framework

The researchers have evaluated strategies for young and adults used by teachers in Pakistani educational institutions. The analytical framework for this particular study is to consider lexicon, academic performance, interpersonal skills, and speaking. The researchers have used CALP and BICS elements to bifurcate translanguaging bilingual strategies for young and adult learners in a bilingual context.

ANALYSIS AND DISCUSSION

Data from the Interviews

The responses of the teachers have been divided and analyzed into three portions.

Perceptions regarding Translanguaging Strategies in Pakistani ELT classrooms

T3 proposed the idea that translanguaging is necessary for the Pakistani context. The students usually come from areas where little English is spoken.

“In Pakistani Scenario, ESL learners come from multiple ethnic backgrounds; it is easier for teachers to use English and local language to provide relatable examples and associative knowledge”.

Similarly, T2 claims it to be a valuable strategy; says

“Students in Pakistani Classrooms are often hesitant in using the English language; it is more comfortable for them if their learning process is backed up with a language they understand well”.

Thus T2 reckons the need to apply translanguaging bilingual strategies in the Pakistani context. Translanguaging is equally significant for both adult and young learners. T5 asserts the necessity of implementing translanguaging strategies for young bilingual learners in Pakistan.

“It is difficult for young learners to understand the linguistic codes of the English language; so for comprehension purposes, the teacher should use other language known to young learners.”

The background of students alongside their language intimacy puts translanguaging in dire demand to be applied in Pakistani educational institutions.

Common Translanguaging Strategies

Since Pakistan is a multilingual country with Urdu as a National language, translanguaging pedagogical strategies have already been practised. Teachers often use their background knowledge to make personalized translanguaging strategies. T6 shares her personalized translanguaging strategy.

“I sometimes ask students to write stories with bilingual characters; this strategy helps them compare English concepts with their language.”

The output from the students lets teachers mould their strategies to achieve effective teaching goals. T5 shares one of her incidents.

“A student asked me the meaning of ragging...I bounced back the question to other students to contemplate and respond in the most understanding manner possible.

Student A: teasing

Student B: کرنازلیل

Teacher: درگت بنانا

Student C: (gestures to crush his palm with his fist) just like this?”

The healthy involvement of students often enriches the translanguaging pedagogy. T3 associates the idea of discussion and interpretation that



“To captivate the students' attention, they are allowed to narrate an incident from their own language, and the teacher interprets and discusses that with the rest of the English language class.”

Meanwhile, T1 also proclaimed the clarification of ideas with translanguaging.

“Translanguaging Strategies are effective. We need to use words from other cultures (languages) to exemplify certain concepts and captivate the students' attention”.

The teachers of both young and adult learners supported various strategies that improved students' performance from all bounds.

Beneficial Effects of Translanguaging Strategies

There were pungent arguments against translanguaging bilingual strategies, claiming success in effective target language teaching can only be achieved through input in the language (De La Campa & Nassaji, 2009). However, the teachers of young learners express their opinions in support of translanguaging and using L1 in classrooms. As T6 says

“Mother tongue does help to improve the critical thinking and communicative skills; it acts a connector between the academic knowledge and English Language”.

However, teachers for adult learners specify translanguaging bilingual strategies for particular learning outcomes. T2 shares the idea that

“Native language should be used only for a domain; for making things clear to the learners; otherwise, the motive of an English language classroom of the adult learner should be to improve the thinking capacity and expression in the English language.”

Thus, Translanguaging strategies can enhance thinking abilities and support effective learning. Wright (2013), as mentioned in Bhatia & Ritchie (eds.) (2014), affirms that teaching bilingual students in the language they understand well is the only criterion. The translanguaging practices follow the rule and promote target language expression.

Data from Observations

The observations' data revealed that several teachers utilize multiple translanguaging strategies involuntarily. Their application of translanguaging bilingual strategies depends upon the needs and requirements of the students. The translanguaging bilingual strategies used in Pakistani Educational Institutions can be classified into multiple categories, as listed in McClain et al. (2021).

1. Appropriate Strategies For Young Learners

1.1 Labeled Questions

The strategy includes connecting English words with native language lexicology with similar meanings. The teacher for young learners usually asks their students to think of a native word that closely relates to the foreign word. It is one of the effective translanguaging strategies for young learners that improve the basic interpersonal skills and cognitive academic language proficiency of a young learner.

1.2 Interpretation Strategy

Young learners often find it difficult to comprehend the meanings and main ideas when provided in long sentences or paragraphs. The teachers for young learners use translation to interpret and explain the concept of the English language. It can be anticipated as the extended strategy of GTM. However, students' understanding seems to be targeted with this strategy.

1.3 Hybrid Utterances

The teacher allows comprehensive code mixing during his lectures. This strategy promotes the use of FL for communicative purposes. Thus, it encourages students to use



more English language in classrooms. Similarly, the teacher uses hybrid utterances to support the understanding of young English language learners.

2. *Appropriate Strategies for Adult Learners*

2.1 Revoiced Interpretation

The particular strategy is used for the complete inference of ideas. The instructor utilizes the response of one student with other students in FL. For instance, Pakistani students provide one-liner explanations, improving their concepts and polishing their FL skills.

2.2 Extended Information

The teachers confine themselves to using English with their students. However, they provide extra chunks of knowledge in the local language for clarification and elaboration. Pakistani ELT practitioners provide similar ideas to validate their explanations.

Comparison of Adult vs Young Learners Strategies

Two languages often lead to better cognitive development and reorganization of the brain (Kovács, 2007). Thus, bilingual strategies in the Pakistani classroom involve enhanced academic and cognitive ability (CALP) and basic interpersonal skills (BICS). The extent to which CALP and BICS develop in a learner varies with age and needs.

The needs of young and adult learners are different. Hussain and Farid (2013) notice that young pupils have a better ability to learn more languages with excellence, with appropriate teaching methodology and a suitable environment.

The utility of the target language for young learners is confined to a particular setting, mostly for academic purposes in Pakistan. Hence, teachers mostly prefer incarcerating these learners' abilities at the morpho-syntactic English language level. That is why the results deduced from the data gathered in this research show that strategies that emphasize lexical development and academics are more useful for young learners. The emphasis remains more on CALP than BICS for young learners.

Newport (1990) claims those adult learners who follow translanguaging bilingual strategies; stand a higher probability ranking of developing academic proficiency and advanced communicative skills. The translanguaging bilingual strategies for adult learners focus equally on BICS and CALP. Such strategies enhance the academic cognition and the communicative skills of adult learners. The study has anticipated that these strategies are more conceptual. They act like a medium where adult learners can polish their expression, knowledge and language skills.

Given the disparities in cognitive development and learning requirements between young and adult learners, research suggests that their effects differ. Including multilingual activities can improve understanding and involvement for young students. It has been demonstrated that, for example, integrating language acquisition into everyday activities efficiently promotes bilingualism. On the other hand, immersion methods that emphasise the target language are frequently advantageous for adult learners. Bialystok (2021) explained that the bilingual education can help preserve languages, but if it is not carried out well, it may also make it more difficult for students to become proficient in the dominant language. Thus, it is essential to adapt language teaching methods to the unique cognitive and contextual requirements of students in order to maximise learning outcomes.

CONCLUSION

Translanguaging bilingual strategies differ for young and adult learners. Adequate strategies provide fruitful improvement in learners' performance. However, such strategies are only applied according to the personal choice and needs of the instructor (Hussain &



Khan, 2021). The institution or the higher educational bodies neither urge translanguaging nor guide translanguaging strategies for young vs adult learners.

Future Directions

The study has inferred that most ELT practitioners use translanguaging strategies in their classrooms. However, translanguaging is often used as an individual practice rather than a collective pedagogical approach for English Language Teaching. Canagarajah (2012) highlights that translanguaging strategies are usually performed without a taxonomic structure. This practice leads to perplexity in the teaching process, making it challenging to incorporate such strategies in real-life classrooms.

Translanguaging bilingual strategies emerge from a unique confluence of pedagogy and culture-linguistic knowledge and achieve more learning paradigms. Lewis et al. (2012) say that translanguaging, when profuse as a deliberate inventory for learning, can lead to multiple pedagogical ideologies and practices. Therefore, this study can direct future researchers to explore the extent of applying structured translanguaging bilingual strategies in Pakistani classrooms, predicting the new ideological inventories of language and learning.

Limitations and Delimitations

The particular study calls for a longitudinal research design that may not be possible for the researchers due to the set time frame and limited recourses. The participants and students of such participants usually speak Urdu and Punjabi. So, the research is confined to similar bilingual learners. The young learners emphasized in this study could not share their responses effectively. So the study has been limited to teachers' responses and their classroom practices through observations.

Declaration Of Conflicting Interests

We declare that this research study is original. There are no conflicts regarding its data collection procedures, participants and resources. The research paper solely belongs to us.

References

- Ali, A. (2021). Understanding the role of Translanguaging in L2 acquisition: Applying Cummins' cup model. *Journal of Cultura and Lingua*, 2(1), 15-25. [10.37301/culingua.v2i1.10](https://doi.org/10.37301/culingua.v2i1.10)
- Almayez, M. (2022). Translanguaging at a Saudi University: discrepancy between English language teachers' attitudes and self-reported pedagogical practices. *Asian-Pacific Journal of Second and Foreign Language Education*. [10.1186/s40862-022-00148-3](https://doi.org/10.1186/s40862-022-00148-3)
- Bhatia, T. K., & Ritchie, W. C. (Eds.). (2014). *The handbook of bilingualism and multilingualism*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Bialystok, E. (2021). Bilingualism: Pathway to cognitive reserve. *Trends in cognitive sciences*, 25(5), 355-364.
- Canagarajah, S. (2012). *Translingual practice: Global Englishes and cosmopolitan relations*. Routledge. [10.4324/9780203073889](https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203073889)
- Clyne, M. (2008). The monolingual mindset as an impediment to the development of plurilingual potential in Australia. *Sociolinguistic Studies*, 2(3), 347-366. <https://doi.org/10.1558/sols.v2i3.347>
- Creese, A., & Blackledge, A. (2010). Translanguaging in the bilingual classroom: A pedagogy for learning and teaching. *The modern language journal*, 94(1), 103-115. [10.1111/j.1540-4781.2009.00986.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-4781.2009.00986.x)
- Cummins J. 1988. Language and literacy acquisition in bilingual contexts *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*. 10: 17-31. DOI: [10.1080/01434632.1989.9994360](https://doi.org/10.1080/01434632.1989.9994360)



- De la Campa, J. C., & Nassaji, H. (2009). The amount, purpose, and reasons for using L1 in L2 classrooms. *Foreign language annals*, 42(4), 742-759. :[10.1111/j.1944-9720.2009.01052.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1944-9720.2009.01052.x)
- Gadet, Françoise. (2010). Penelope Gardner-Chloros. Code-switching, 2009, 254 pages. Cambridge University Press. *Journal of Language Contact*.3. <https://doi.org/10.1163/19552629-90000026>
- García, O., & Wei, L. (2014). Language, bilingualism and education. In *Translanguaging: Language, bilingualism and education* (pp. 46-62). Palgrave Pivot, London. <https://doi.org/10.1057/9781137385765>
- Goodman, B., & Tastanbek, S. (2021). Making the shift from code-switching to a Translanguaging lens in English language teacher education. *TESOL Quarterly*, 55(1), 29-53. [10.1002/tesq.571](https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.571)
- Harvey, R. E., & Wong, K. M. (2024). Promoting emergent literacy in preschool through extended discourse: Covert translanguaging in a Mandarin immersion environment. *Journal of Early Childhood Literacy*, 24(3), 663-691. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050.2016.1231773>
- Hussain, M. S., & Farid, A. (2013). English Language Teaching to young learners: possible pitfalls after lowering the age of compulsory English in Pakistan. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics and English Literature*, 2(3), 95-99. [10.7575/aiac.ijalel.v.2n.3p.95](https://doi.org/10.7575/aiac.ijalel.v.2n.3p.95)
- Hussain, S., & Khan, H. K. (2021). Translanguaging in Pakistani Higher Education: A Neglected Perspective. *Journal of Educational Research and Social Sciences Review (JERSSR)*, 1(3), 16-24.
- Igboanusi, H. (2014). The English-only language education policy in The Gambia and low literacy rates. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 17(5), 558-569. [10.1080/13670050.2013.851642](https://doi.org/10.1080/13670050.2013.851642)
- Kostere, S., & Kostere, K. (2021). *The generic qualitative approach to a dissertation in the social sciences: A step by step guide*. Routledge.
- Kovács, Á. M. (2007). Beyond language: Childhood bilingualism enhances high-level cognitive functions. In *Cognitive aspects of bilingualism* (pp. 301-323). Springer, Dordrecht. [10.1007/978-1-4020-5935-3_10](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-4020-5935-3_10)
- Lewis, G., Jones, B., & Baker, C. (2012). Translanguaging: Developing its conceptualisation and contextualisation. *Educational Research and Evaluation*, 18(7), 655-670. [10.1080/13803611.2012.718490](https://doi.org/10.1080/13803611.2012.718490)
- Madkur, A., Friska, Y., & Lisnawati, L. (2022). Translanguaging Pedagogy in ELT Practices: Experiences of Teachers in Indonesian Pesantren-based Schools. *VELES Voices of English Language Education Society*, 6(1), 130-143. <https://doi.org/10.29408/veles.v6i1.5136>
- Makalela, L. (2015). BREAKING AFRICAN LANGUAGE BOUNDARIES: STUDENT-TEACHERS REFLECTIONS ON TRANSLANGUAGING PRACTICES. *Language Matters*, 46(2), 275-292. : [10.1080/10228195.2014.986664](https://doi.org/10.1080/10228195.2014.986664)
- Martin-Beltrán, M. (2014). “What do you want to say?” How adolescents use translanguaging to expand learning opportunities. *International Multilingual Research Journal*, 8(3), 208-230. : [10.4324/9781315180052-7](https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315180052-7)
- Mazak, C. M. (2016). 1. Introduction: Theorizing Translanguaging Practices in Higher Education. In *Translanguaging in higher education* (pp. 1-10). *Multilingual Matters*. : [10.21832/9781783096657-003](https://doi.org/10.21832/9781783096657-003)
- McClain, J. B., Mancilla-Martinez, J., Flores, I., & Buckley, L. (2021). Translanguaging to support emergent bilingual students in English dominant preschools: An explanatory sequential mixed-method study. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 44(2), 158-173. : [10.1080/15235882.2021.1963014](https://doi.org/10.1080/15235882.2021.1963014)



- Newport, E. L. (1990). Maturation constraints on language learning. *Cognitive science*, 14(1), 11-28. [10.1016/0364-0213\(90\)90024-Q](https://doi.org/10.1016/0364-0213(90)90024-Q)
- Ooi, W. Z., & Aziz, A. A. (2021). Translanguaging Pedagogy in the ESL Classroom: A Systematic Review. [10.6007/IJARPED/v10-i3/10816](https://doi.org/10.6007/IJARPED/v10-i3/10816)
- Pentimonti, J. M., Justice, L. M., Yeomans-Maldonado, G., McGinty, A. S., Slocum, L., & O'Connell, A. (2017). Teachers' use of high-and low-support scaffolding strategies to differentiate language instruction in high-risk/economically disadvantaged settings. *Journal of Early Intervention*, 39(2), 125-146. [10.1177/1053815117700865](https://doi.org/10.1177/1053815117700865)
- Prokopchuk, N. (2022). Learning Module Two: Theories That Have Transformed Language Education. *Language Learning in K-12 Schools: Theories, Methodologies, and Best Practices*.
- Rafi, A. S. M., & Morgan, A. M. (2022). Translanguaging and power in academic writing discourse: the case of a Bangladeshi university. *Classroom Discourse*, 1-23. [10.1080/19463014.2022.2046621](https://doi.org/10.1080/19463014.2022.2046621)
- Rafi, M. S., & K Fox, R. (2020). Translanguaging and Multilingual Teaching and Writing Practices in a Pakistani University: Pedagogical Implications for Students and Faculty. [10.15626/hn.20204504](https://doi.org/10.15626/hn.20204504)
- Romanowski, P. (2019). Translanguaging in the Polish educational context: Lessons learnt from IB schools. *Bellaterra Journal of Teaching & Learning Language & Literature*, 12(1), 5-24. [10.5565/rev/jtl3.795](https://doi.org/10.5565/rev/jtl3.795)
- Rose, H., McKinley, J., & Galloway, N. (2021). Global Englishes and language teaching: A review of pedagogical research. *Language Teaching*, 54(2), 157-189.
- Sah, P. K., & Kubota, R. (2022). Towards critical translanguaging: a review of literature on English as a medium of instruction in South Asia's school education. *Asian Englishes*, 1-15 <https://doi.org/10.1080/13488678.2022.2056796>
- Saleh & Rafi. (2020). Shortcomings of validating translanguaging without pedagogic focus in bilingual classroom. *The Newsletter of Bilingual-Multilingual Education Interest Section, TESOL International Association.* [10.5281/zenodo.4539753](https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.4539753)
- Storch, Neomy & Aldosari, Ali. (2010). Learners' use of first language (Arabic) in pair work in an EFL class. *Language Teaching Research*. 14. 355-375. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1362168810375362>
- Treffers-Daller, J. (2025). Translanguaging: What is it besides smoke and mirrors?. *Linguistic Approaches to Bilingualism*, 15(1), 1-26.
- Turnbull, B. (2019). Translanguaging in the planning of academic and creative writing: A case of adult Japanese EFL learners. *Bilingual Research Journal*. 42. 1-20. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15235882.2019.1589603>
- Wang, D. (2016). Translanguaging in Chinese foreign language classrooms: students and teachers' attitudes and practices. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*. 22. 1-12.
- Wright, L. (2023). How Multilingualism Came to Be Ignored in the History of Standard English. *Multilingualism and History*, 107-122.
- Zabrodskaja, A. (2013). Bilingual education in the 21st century: A global perspective by Ofelia García. *Language in Society*. [10.2307/23473608](https://doi.org/10.2307/23473608)